OXBOROUGH PARISH COUNCIL

2023/1 MINUTES

EXTRAORDINARY MEETING held in the Village Hall, Oxborough

Wednesday 13 April 2022, starting at 7.30pm

PRESENT: Simon Willies Chair

Bernie Chapman Vice Chair Graham Allison Councillor Ian Monson Councillor

9 Members of the public

Open Forum (questions regarding the Agenda)

Mr. David Hotchkin explained that he had gone through all the paperwork for each quote and that he strongly urged the PC to accept Dr. Stump, for the following reasons: they have been established since 2016 and without being asked, had supplied full paperwork, including generic Risk Assessment and Method Statement (RAMS), had indicated a requirement for the road to be closed as the safest method and the cost seemed reasonable for what was proposed. Target Trees (established 2021) had confirmed that they would only supply RAMS if they were selected for the job, Arborcare had gaps in their paperwork, Norfolk Arborist (established 2019) supplied insufficient detail and Golden Trees (established 2018) the lead time was too long. There is a question mark over the reverse charge on VAT for the traffic management (where VAT is not charged by the contractor). Mrs. Eileen Stapleton asked if the chippings and timber would be made available for villagers to take away, including all the leavings and Cllr Chapman confirmed that all the odd bits and smaller cuts would be chipped, placed into convenient piles and the timber would be cut into appropriate lengths and also piled up and made free to all villagers, but that this would be for a set time only, after which the leftovers would be removed. The Chair emphasized that no activity would be permitted until the entire tree felling exercise had been completed, to ensure safety for everyone. Mr. Chris Heatley asked if the road closure would impact the road adjacent to his house and Cllr Chapman suggested that this would be managed professionally and the diversion in place would direct traffic around the boundary of Oxborough.

1. Apologies for absence

Cllr Holloway had extended her apologies due to ill health.

2. Declarations of Interest

None.

3. Declarations of recording and social media use

None.

4. To select a contractor from the 5 quotes received to fell the Beech Tree:

Felling/ dismantling	Traffic Management	TM details	Further costs	Replacement Tree quoted	Notes	Start Date	RAMS	Public Liability Insurance Certificate
£4490	£700			£250	Subject to VAT	Within the month of the go-ahead. Cherry picker hire - within one week.	Supplied	Supplied £5M
£6000	£2000	Road closure		No	Subject to VAT	7 days after the 'go ahead'	Supplied	Supplied £5M
£5220			Crane hire included in quote	No	Subject to VAT	Week commencing 23 May	Supplied	Supplied £5M
£12500				No	Subject to VAT	End of June/July	Not supplied until contracted	Requested
£7083.33				No	Subject to VAT	In April	Supplied	Supplied £10M
	£4490 £6000 £5220 £12500	dismantling Management £4490	dismantling Management £4490 £700 £6000 £2000 Road closure £5220 £12500	dismantling Management costs £4490 £700 £6000 £2000 Road closure £5220 Crane hire included in quote £12500 £7083.33	dismantling Management costs Tree quoted £4490 £700 £250 £6000 £2000 Road closure No £5220 Crane hire included in quote No £12500 No No	dismantling Management costs Tree quoted £4490 £700 £250 Subject to VAT £6000 £2000 Road closure No Subject to VAT £5220 Crane hire included in quote £12500 No Subject to VAT £7083.33 No Subject to VAT	dismantling Management costs Tree quoted £4490 £4490 £700 £250 Subject to VAT month of the go-ahead. Cherry picker hire - within one week. £6000 £2000 Road closure Crane hire included in quote £12500 No Subject to VAT Week commencing 23 May £12500 No Subject to VAT Lambda in quote In April	E4490 E700 E700 E250 Subject to VAT Within the go-ahead. Cherry picker hire - within one week.

Cllr Allison pointed out that The Norfolk Arborist would use a crane to take down the tree, but Cllr Willies related how Dr. Stump had described the use of lines and pulleys to carefully reduce the branches from the sides first and then from the crown downwards. Cllr Monson expressed his concern at the prospect of the road being closed for 3-4 days which would make it difficult if not disastrous for farming work. Cllr Allison thought it would be unlikely for the diversion signs to be removed each night and then replaced each morning, but Cllr Chapman disagreed saying that this could be exactly what could be done. He went on to say that he agreed with David Hotchkin's summary. Cllr Monson agreed that Target Trees should be eliminated as they are too expensive and had refused to supply RAMS as requested. He asked Mr. Hotchkin for reassurance that his offer to pay for the tree felling would stand and Mr. Hotchkin reassured the council of this. Cllr Monson added that he remained committed to paying £750 towards the cost of the traffic management and Cllr Allison asked him if he would reclaim the VAT -to which he said yes. Dr. Stump's total quote amounted to £9600 (which includes the VAT) and the Chair advised that the VAT component would be reclaimable and refunded to the benefactors as and when they asked for it. Cllr Allison said that he would support the choice of David Hotchkin as he was paying for the job and Cllr Chapman considered Dr. Stump to by the most experienced operator, likely to carry out the felling in the correct manner. The Chair asked for a proposal and Cllr Chapman proposed that the PC engage Dr. Stump for the job, this was seconded by Cllr Willies - a show of hands was unanimous. Cllr Chapman asked the Clerk to contact Dr. Stump immediately (she confirmed that this would be done on her return home after the meeting). Regarding the replacement tree, Cllr Monson suggested this should be left until the Autumn. Finally, Mr. Hotchkin added that the beech tree felling should be completed in one go, rather than reduced to a certain height (for any reason) and risk the chance of it falling down (from rot) or further expense to engage another tree surgeon. Cllrs agreed that the tree should be taken down to the ground.

The meeting closed at 7.57pm